STATES OF JERSEY



PROPOSED GOVERNMENT PLAN 2024-2027 (P.72/2023): TWENTY-FIRST AMENDMENT

LE ROCQUIER SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY SPORTS FACILITIES

Lodged au Greffe on 27th November 2023 by the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel

STATES GREFFE

PROPOSED GOVERNMENT PLAN 2024-2027 (P.72/2023): TWENTY-FIRST AMENDMENT

1 PAGE 3, PARAGRAPH (I) –

After the words "Appendix 3 to the Report" insert the words -

"except that, on Page 66, after the words "urgency and readiness of projects in year." there should be inserted the following new paragraph –

"The funding of at least of £4.705 million (approved in the Government Plan 2020-2023 and Government Plan 2021-2024) for the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities will be reviewed with the intent that the project is reprioritised, in order to improve access to sports facilities in the East of the Island."

CHILDREN, EDUCATION AND HOME AFFAIRS SCRUTINY PANEL

Note: After this amendment, the proposition would read as follows -

THE STATES are asked to decide whether they are of opinion -

to receive the Government Plan 2024 – 2027 specified in Article 9(1) of the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019 ("the Law") and specifically –

- (a) to approve the estimate of total States income to be paid into the Consolidated Fund in 2024 as set out in Appendix 2 Summary Table 1 to the Report, which is inclusive of the proposed taxation and impôts duties changes outlined in the Government Plan, in line with Article 9(2)(a) of the Law;
- (b) to refer to their Act dated 30th September 2016 and to approve the application of existing resources for work on the development of 'user pays' charges in relation to all aspects of waste, including commercial and domestic liquid and solid waste;
- (c) to approve the proposed Changes to Approval for financing/borrowing for 2024, as shown in Appendix 2 – Summary Table 2 to the Report, which may be obtained by the Minister for Treasury and Resources, as and when required, in line with Article 9 (2)(c) of the Law, of up to those revised approvals;
- (d) to approve the extension of the use of the existing Revolving Credit Facility to include the provision of funds that would otherwise be implemented through bank overdraft or bank overdraft facilities under Article 26 (1)(a) of the Law, should they be needed, subject to the limits outlined in that article;

- (e) to approve the transfers from one States fund to another for 2024 of up to and including the amounts set in Appendix 2 Summary Table 3 in line with Article 9(2)(b) of the Law;
- (f) to approve a transfer from the Consolidated Fund to the Stabilisation Fund in 2024 of up to £25 million, subject to a decision of the Minister for Treasury and Resources based on the availability of funds in the Consolidated Fund as at 31 December 2023 in excess of the estimates provided in this plan, or from budgeted underspends identified before 31 December 2024;
- (g) to approve each major project that is to be started or continued in 2024 and the total cost of each such project and any amendments to the proposed total cost of a major project under a previously approved Government Plan, in line with Article 9(2)(d), (e) and (f) of the Law and as set out in Appendix 2 Summary Table 4 to the Report;
- (h) to approve the proposed amount to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund for 2024, for each Head of Expenditure, being gross expenditure less estimated income (if any), in line with Articles 9(2)(g), 10(1) and 10(2) of the Law, and set out in Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report;
- (i) to approve the estimated income, being estimated gross income less expenditure, that each States trading operation will pay into its trading fund in Page 3 P.72/2023 2024 in line with Article 9(2)(h) of the Law and set out in Appendix 2 Summary Table 6 to the Report;
- (j) to approve the proposed amount to be appropriated from each States trading operation's trading fund for 2024 for each head of expenditure in line with Article 9(2)(i) of the Law and set out in Appendix 2 Summary Table 7 to the Report;
- (k) to approve the estimated income and expenditure proposals for the Climate Emergency Fund for 2024 as set out in Appendix 2 – Summary Table 8 to the Report; and
- to approve, in accordance with Article 9(1) of the Law, the Government Plan 2024-2027, as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report, except that, on Page 66, after the words "urgency and readiness of projects in year." should be inserted the following new paragraph –

"The funding of at least of $\pounds 4.705$ million (approved in the Government Plan 2020-2023 and Government Plan 2021-2024) for the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities will be reviewed with the intent that the project is reprioritised, in order to improve access to sports facilities in the East of the Island.".

REPORT

The Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (the 'Panel') has found that the scope of Government proposals to develop the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities have been reduced since the approved Government Plans of 2020-2023 and 2021 - 2024.

The Panel has reviewed the information presented about the planned project over the past five years and suggests that, based on information provided to the States Assembly and the public, there could be reasonable expectations that it is a project that would have been progressed, as it had indicative capital expenditure approved as part of previous Government Plans.

The Panel recognises that the funding for the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities project was listed as part of a broader Head of Expenditure (HoE), originally titled '*Schools extensions and Improvements*', and it never received approval as a specifically named major project for the Government Plan 2020-2023. However, whilst it is noted that the purpose of the Grouped HoE is to permit flexibility and prioritisation of expenditure, the Panel opines that there is a principle around the presentation of certain information to support the approval of funding, which is then not used for that identified purpose.

The purpose of this Amendment is to bring the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities project to the attention of Assembly members. The Panel is of the opinion that this is a worthy project which, if taken forward, would provide benefits to Islanders and fit with the Government's Common Strategic Policy for 2023-2026. However, the Amendment is also brought to highlight concerns the Panel has surrounding the lack of transparency in the process by which this project - and potentially others - have been reduced.

How has the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities project been presented in previous Government Plans? How has this changed since 2019?

Government Plan 2020-2023:

The 'Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities' project was not part of the $\pounds 2$ million of funding approved as part of the 'Schools extensions and Improvements' for 2020 (per table 3(ii) of <u>P.71/2019</u>), but in the supporting information for that HoE, it was indicated that the project would be developed from 2021 onwards. There was also a separate proposed line of expenditure in the sum of £750,000 for the Capital Programme area: 'School 3G Pitch replacements' which was approved for use in 2020.

An excerpt of the Government Plan 2020-2023:

| | | | | | | | Total | Decision |
|--|------------|----|--------|--------|--------|--------|---------|----------|
| Capital Programme area | Department | Sb | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2020-23 | |
| | | | (£000) | (£000) | (£000) | (£000) | (£000) | (£000) |
| Schools extensions and Improvements | GHE | | 2,000 | 5,701 | 5,650 | 1,750 | 15,101 | 2,000 |
| Le Rocquier - school & community sports facilities | | 1 | | 1,305 | 2,400 | 1,000 | 4,705 | |
| School 3G Pitch replacements | | 1 | 750 | 750 | 750 | 750 | 3,000 | |

Furthermore, a supporting report to the Government Plan 2020-23 (R.91/2019) provided further details about the proposals for the funding:

| Title | | Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities | | | | | |
|---|--|---|--------------|--|--|--|--|
| Lead De | partment | CYPES | | | | | |
| Capital Investment Required (£'000) | | | | | | | |
| 2020 | 2021 | 2022 2023 | | | | | |
| - | 1,305 | 2,400 | 1,000 | | | | |
| Sur | nmary of Capital Busi | ness Case Submission | n | | | | |
| Le Rocquier school has (last census) 772 students on roll and has capacity for up to 900. It is the catchment school for students living in the east of the island. At present there are no sporting / fitness facilities in the east of the island for community use except FB Fields, which is solely for outdoor sports such as cricket, football and athletics. This request for capital funding relates to the need to improve the facilities for the students at Le Rocquier School and the need to offer the surrounding community access to a fit for purpose sporting facility. The objective is to ensure that the students are given every opportunity to maximise their experience and enjoyment of sport in the curriculum. This in turn supports the initiatives from other Government departments to encourage a more active lifestyle and includes the wider community, as part of the overall health, well-being and productivity of all islanders. | | | | | | | |
| The project requirements are; | | | | | | | |
| 1. To demolish the existing sports hall | | | | | | | |
| 2. Build a new sports hall, gym, fitness suite and dance studio | | | | | | | |
| Ensure that the usage | ······································ | | | | | | |
| Ensure that the | re is an office for curricu | ulum staff and a commu | inity office | | | | |
| Investment in the outside area with the addition of a full sized 3G pitch with floodlights. | | | | | | | |

2

1

¹ 'Government Plan 2020-23', Government of Jersey, p.147 ² 'Government Plan 2020-2023: Further Information on Additional Revenue Expenditure and Capital and Major Project Expenditure' (R.91/2019), Council of Ministers, 24th July 2019, p.205

With reference to the separate capital business case submission in R.91/2019 for third generation (3G) outside pitch replacements, six schools were named as the beneficiaries of these, including Le Rocquier.³

Government Plan 2021 - 2024

The total capital expenditure and spending profile for both the '*Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities*' and the '*School 3G Pitch replacements*' remained the same as in the previous Government Plan.

The Proposition tabled to the States Assembly received approval for £5.901 million for 'School extensions and Improvements' (in table 5(ii) of the Proposition P.130/2020). Of this, £1.305 million was indicated for use for the 'Le Rocquier and school / community sports facilities' in 2021.

For the two projects mentioned above, the report for the Government Plan 2021-24 indicated the following breakdown of expenditure over the four year period:

| | Department | CSP | 2021 (£000) | 2022 (£000) | 2023 (£000) | 2024 (£000) | Total 2021-2024 (£000) |
|--|------------|--------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|------------------------------|
| Schools extensions and Improvements | IHE | | 5,901 | 6,700 | 1,750 | 750 | 15,101 |
| Le Rocquier and school/community sports facilities School 3G Pitch replacements | IHE IHE | 1 1 | 1,305 750 | 2,400 750 | 1,000 750 | 750 | 4,705 3,000 |

4

Government Plan 2022 - 2025

The total capital expenditure for both the 'Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities' and the 'School 3G Pitch replacements' was reduced and the spending reprofiled across the 4-year period:

| | Sponsor/ Lead Dept | CSP | 2022 Estimate (£000) | 2023 Estimate (£000) | 2024 Estimate (£000) | 2025 Estimate (£000) | Total 2022-25 (£000) |
|--|--------------------------|--------|----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| School & Educational Developments | | | 10,650 | 13,143 | 12,586 | 25,655 | 62,034 |
| Le Rocquier and school/community sports facilities School 3G Pitch replacements | CYPES CYPES | 1 1 | 3,150 | 1,000 750 | 750 | - 750 | |

5

The Proposition approved by the States Assembly received approval for £10.650 million of funding for 'School & Educational Developments' (as part of table 5ii of the Proposition <u>P.90/2021</u>). Of this (as detailed in the extract above), £3.150 million was indicated for use for the 'Le Rocquier and school / community sports facilities' in 2022. To clarify the difference between in total expenditure for each project across the 4-year period of each Government Plan:

³ Ibid, p.206

⁴ '<u>Government Plan 2021-24</u>', Government of Jersey, p.143

⁵ 'Government Plan 2022-25', Government of Jersey, p. 138

| | GP 20-23 / GP 21-24 (£000) | GP 22-25 (£000) | Difference (£000) |
|---|-------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|
| Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities | 4,705 | 4,150 | (555) |
| School 3G Pitch replacements | 3,000 | 2,250 | (750) |

Furthermore, the Government Plan 2022-2025 report stated that:

"The Le Rocquier School and Community Sports facilities project intends to deliver on the early expansion of school and sports facilities to the East of the island. The project will provide for a new school hall, along with assessing the future requirements for a sports centre."⁶

The Panel suggests that the presentation of the project in this way implies that there is a certainty with which the project has been approved and will proceed.

Government Plan 2023 – 2026

This was the first Government Plan following the Island wide election in 2022, which saw a change of Government and Ministerial leadership.

The Panel noted that the sports facilities at Le Rocquier were listed for development under the '*New School and Educational Developments*' Grouped HoE.⁷ The Panel established that the '*New School and Educational Developments*' HoE (and also '*Upgrades to CYPES Estates*' Head of Expenditure) had been created to give the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills (CYPES) flexibility over various development projects.

Last year, in response to a question in a public hearing (on 9th November 2022) about the proposed sporting facilities at Le Rocquier, the Minister for Children and Education provided details about where she saw responsibility for the future project plans:

"I am also waiting to hear from the Sport Minister and from Jersey Sport because I found 3 different options. I think I think this decision needs to be done on the corporate level and not just on my level because it was like are we creating a bigger facility, a smaller facility, what type of facility, is it only for school, or is it for all community? At the moment that it has become not just me saying I want just school facilities, which will not be right, and we are looking into having community schools, the decision should be taken at a corporate level and definitely it is on the list to do about the future."⁸

In its review of the Government Plan 2023-2026, the Panel made the following recommendation:

⁶ 'Government Plan 2022-25', Government of Jersey, p.135

⁷ <u>Government Plan 2023-2026</u>, Government of Jersey, p. 59 and Letter – Minister for Children and Education to the

Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, 8th November 2022, p. 5

⁸ Transcript – Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education – 9th November 2022, p.7

RECOMMENDATION 12

The Minister for Children and Education should provide further detail and in the next Government Plan about the prioritisation of the projects in the 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure, so that there is public transparency about any changes made by the department to priorities.

9

The Minister accepted this recommendation from the Panel. The formal response provided to the Panel stated that "*The Minister will endeavour to provide a clearer more details of planned estates projects and their prioritisation within future Government Plans*".¹⁰

The Panel has not seen any evidence that details about priorities have been included in the latest Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027

In response to queries from the Panel, the Minister for Children and Education provided the following update about the Le Rocquier project:

"A feasibility study has commenced on upgrading the current Le Rocquier sports centre building to ensure access, health and safety, and curriculum needs for the school are addressed. This includes exploring the addition of a full sized 3G pitch. It is expected this feasibility work will be completed in 2024, at which time its inclusion in the Capital Plan will be reviewed."¹¹

The Minister for Children and Education provided some further details in a public hearing with the Panel:

'I received a presentation. It was not a deep feasibility study, it was like options that were presented, which I liked the idea but it was not deliverable for the envelope because the price tag was £70 million on that. It would be great but it was not only in my portfolio, as you can imagine, it was much bigger as a sport facility for the community; it is under a different remit. This is why they have gone back to very specific what we can do for C.Y.P.E.S. from the C.Y.P.E.S. budget. '12

The Panel notes that not enough information has been provided about the status of the project and its progress since funding was initially approved in 2020. The Panel is unclear what has been done since 2020 for the work to remain at a feasibility stage in 2023.

The Panel would like to see a full examination of how (or if) funding which has previously been approved under the relevant HoE has been utilised for the Le Rocquier project and will be making a recommendation to reflect this.

⁹ 'Government Plan 2023-2026: Scrutiny Review' (<u>S.R.21/2022</u>), Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, 8th December 2022, p.72

¹⁰ Response of the Minister for Children and Education to S.R.21/2022, 23rd January 2023, p.8

¹¹ Letter – Minister for Children and Education to the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, 24th October 2023, p.7

¹² Transcript - Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education – 31st October 2023, p.35

The Panel is of the opinion that the project for Le Rocquier sports facilities has been deprioritised by Government and that the process by which this has been undertaken, through the use of the Grouped HoE has not been transparent for the Members of the Assembly or the public. The Panel will be reiterating its recommendations that further detail should be provided about the projects in the Grouped Heads of Expenditure, so that there is transparency about departmental and Government priorities.

The Chief Executive Officer of Jersey Sport made the following written submission to the Panel's review on 2nd November 2023:

CYPES Estates Upgrades

Jersey Sport was very disappointed to learn that money in the previous government plan to upgrade the Sports Facilities at Le Rocquier School has been removed, with some money being made available in later years. The school's sports facilities are in poor condition and unsuitable. We believe upgrading the current facilities and adding a synthetic pitch is needed ASAP and should not be delayed.¹³

The Panel had previously ascertained that the Le Rocquier project formed part of the '*New School and Educational Developments*' HoE, however, in its review of the Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 (P.72/2023), the Panel was advised that:

"The projects previously held in New School and Educational Developments have since become Major Projects and therefore are presented separately. These being the Mont à L'Abbé Secondary School and Le Squez (Youth Centre and Community Hub)"¹⁴

Proposed funding for future years under this Grouped HoE has not been detailed.

In response to queries in the public hearing, the Minister also advised that some of the funding for the work to improve accessibility and disability would be funded through the 'School Improvements' allocation of the 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' Grouped Head of Expenditure¹⁵. Le Rocquier was referenced as part of this discussion, but no specific breakdown was provided to the Panel.

Inspiring Active Places Strategy 2021 ('IAP Strategy')

The Panel notes the context of the IAP Strategy, published by the Government of Jersey in 2021, which stated that "*The vision for Le Rocquier is that it is developed as the public sport and wellbeing hub for the east of the Island*".¹⁶ The plans included a wide range of improvements and developments across the whole Island and referenced £100 million worth of potential investment (<u>note</u>: this level of funding was never formally approved).

A public consultation was undertaken on the IAP Strategy, however, the Panel is unable to find the results of this published on the gov.je website. A news release from 4^{th} August 2021 referenced the results of the consultation, which included the statistic that 75% of

October 2023, p.7

¹³ Written Submission - Jersey Sport - 2nd November 2023

¹⁴ Letter – Minister for Children and Education to the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, 24th

¹⁵ Transcript – Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, CEHA Review of the Proposed Government Plan 2024 – 2027, p.25-26

¹⁶ Inspiring Active Places Strategy 2021, Government of Jersey, 2021, p.24

the survey respondents had supported the idea of a modern sports facility in the east of the Island.¹⁷

The Panel is aware that the Economics and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel has queried the status of the IAP Strategy, however, at the time of drafting this report a response to its most recent written queries¹⁸ was yet to be received.

Comments in the States Assembly

In response to an oral question about Le Rocquier Sports Facilities in the States Assembly on 17th July 2023, the Assistant Minister for Infrastructure (who is also Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture with responsibility for Sports Policy) stated that further clarity on funding of the Le Rocquier project would be available in September 2023 after the publication of the Government Plan, but highlighted that the project was still under consideration between Jersey Property Holdings, CYPES, Jersey Sport and the School. She stated that:

For me and for others around the table, the way to ensure that we could deliver for the school, which is the immediate priority, is to reframe this work into something that is achievable in the current climate and current situation with other pressures around capital projects, hence why this project has now been handed over, as it were, to C.Y.P.E.S. with others working with them.¹⁹

The Assistant Minister also stated that:

My vision for sport in the east of the Island in the short term is to push this project in a realistic and achievable way, which means handing it back to C.Y.P.E.S. so that schools' priorities can be met.²⁰

In response to supplementary questions at the same sitting, the Assistant Minister stated that:

This is not a case of losing funding for Le Rocquier. There was never any funding in the first place.²¹

With reference to the Hansard of that sitting, there were verbal references to significant sums of money which the Panel notes had not received approval (for example a proposed £70 million scheme was referenced). However, the Panel references the funding of £4.705 million that was earmarked for developing the sports facilities at Le Rocquier School. No scheme has resulted from this funding and it is not clear where that funding has been moved to.

Conclusion

In conclusion the Panel highlights the following points:

¹⁷ News release, Government of Jersey, 4th August 2021, <u>https://www.gov.je/news/2021/pages/iapsurveyresults.aspx</u> (accessed 16th November 2023) ¹⁸ Letter – Economics and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel to the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism,

Sport and Culture

Hansard - States Assembly, 17th July 2023, paragraph number 4.6

²⁰ Hansard - States Assembly, 17th July 2023, paragraph number 4.6.8

²¹ Hansard - States Assembly, 17th July 2023, paragraph number 4.6.11

- The sports facilities at Le Rocquier school are in poor condition and unsuitable. Feasibility work has started to review the project and it is anticipated that the current scope of capital works will include the creation of a 3G pitch and an extension and refurbishment of the sports hall. This scope is reduced, in comparison to the plans which were presented to the States Assembly as part of the Government Plan 2020 – 2023 which included demolition and rebuild to include community use facilities.
- There is a lack of indoor sports or fitness facilities in the East of the Island for public use and access. Whilst earlier project plans for the Le Rocquier site indicated that there would be an element of community use available (with recognition that suitable separations and safeguards would need to be embedded to the building), this community access aspect has disappeared from the plans. The most recent updates indicate that the project is being taken forward as a project for the school, rather than a community development.
- Whilst no funding was approved as part of the IAP Strategy, there was indicative funding of £4.705 million approved as part of the Government Plan for 2020-2023 and subsequent years for 'Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities'. For the Assistant Minister for Infrastructure to advise that there was "*never any funding in the first place*" for Le Rocquier is concerning to the Panel and raises questions about the accountability of funding approved for the Grouped HoE.
- The Panel notes that reduction in the scope of the Le Rocquier sports facilities project has not been publicly documented. As there was a level of funding previously approved by the States Assembly, the Panel asserts that there should be a clear trail or explanation provided for the changes and reductions to the project funding.
- The Ministerial ownership of the project has changed and the Panel queries where and when the decision to transfer the project between departments (Infrastructure to CYPES) was made. The evidence suggests that the project has suffered from a lack of continuity and direction and so the Panel recommends that clarity over the scope, ownership, and funding will provide a clear future direction.
- The Panel highlights that the format of the Government Plan and use of Grouped HoE allows Departments to change priorities with less accountability to the Assembly. To remove or deprioritise projects which have been highlighted to the States Assembly as part of the Government Plan without providing details about why priorities have changed, does not make the Government accountable. The Panel suggests that there could be a wider discussion around the accountability of the Grouped HoE and, as part of its review of the Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027, the Panel intends to highlight this in its findings.
- The Panel notes that the current status of the project will be determined by the Government after the feasibility study is concluded. The Panel feels that certainty for the project is required in order for it to make progress, therefore, it has brought this amendment before the Assembly to bring it to the attention of

Members, create further accountability, and provide some certainty for the future of the project.

Financial and manpower implications

The amendment specifically references that the Le Rocquier School and Community Sports Facilities' project is reprioritised within the Grouped Head of Expenditure for [Capital Development / projects] and so it is envisaged that it would not create any new financial or staffing implications for 2024.

An updated budget for the capital project would need to be confirmed as a consequence of this amendment, but the Panel anticipates that, if suitable, this would be taken forward as part of the Government Plan for 2025 - 2028.